Evidence-Based Elections Colorado's Future?

Philip B. Stark

Department of Statistics University of California, Berkeley

14 December 2011 Colorado Elections Best Practices & Vision Commission Denver, CO

Election Audits: Compliance and Materiality

Compliance audit

Determine whether the audit trail is trustworthy enough to determine who won.

Materiality audit

Use the audit trail to confirm that the outcome is correct, or to correct the outcome if it is wrong.

▲ロ ▶ ▲周 ▶ ▲ ヨ ▶ ▲ ヨ ▶ ● の Q @

Requires intact audit trail–need to pass compliance audit first. Might require counting the entire audit trail by hand.

Risk-Limiting Audits (Required by Colorado Revised Statutes 1-7-515)

Risk-limiting Audit

Large, known chance of a full hand count if the outcome is wrong, in which case the hand count corrects the outcome.

Risk is maximum chance of failing to correct an apparent outcome that is wrong, no matter what caused the outcome to be wrong.

Gives statistical assurance that voting system found the right winner(s).

RLA

- Requires an audit trail: voter-marked paper ballots or voter-verifiable paper records.
- Doesn't absolutely guarantee the electoral outcome is right, but guarantees a large chance of correcting the outcome if the outcome is wrong.
- "Intelligent" incremental recount: stops only when there is convincing evidence that a full hand count won't change the outcome.
- Until the evidence is strong, counting continues, possibly to a full hand count.
- Absent a full hand count, will not alter election outcomes: Can correct wrong outcomes, but can't harm correct outcomes.

Current Situation in Colorado

- CRS 1-7-515 is best audit law in the world, effective 2014. (Some details to flesh out—I'm happy to help.)
- Heterogeneous mix of equipment and systems, including unauditable (no paper) and obsolescent.
- Compliance with the law with no change to current systems will be expensive: need to audit at the ballot level to be efficient.
- No deployed vote-tabulation system (VTS) makes ballot-level auditing possible on its own.

Three Options for Colorado

 Upgrade voting systems to next-next. (Systems currently in review for certification won't do it). Expensive.

Many jurisdictions can't afford to replace current systems.

2. Scan ballots a second time and base the audit on CVRs extracted from that scan.

Time-consuming. Have to touch ballots twice. Workable in small jurisdictions but hard in Jefferson or Denver. (However, talk to Clear Ballot Group, TrueBallot, TEVS.)

 Replace the system of record with an alternative system that makes auditing easy.
 Colorado does not require federal certification—well situated.

VTS Certification and Risk-Limiting Audits

Question 1

In the lab, can the vote-tabulation system—as delivered from the manufacturer—count votes with a specified level of accuracy?

Question 2

As maintained, deployed, and used in the current election, did the vote-tabulation system find the true winners?

▲ロ ▶ ▲周 ▶ ▲ ヨ ▶ ▲ ヨ ▶ ● の Q @

Only care about Q1 insofar as it matters for Q2.

Certification addresses Q1. Risk-limiting audits address Q2.

Claim

If elections create an accurate, durable audit trail and the vote tabulation is checked with a risk-limiting audit, there is little harm—and much benefit—from abandoning certification of vote-tabulation systems.

- Makes ballot-level auditing easy.
- Drastically reduces costs.
- Speeds development/improvement cycle.
- Can be based on COTS scanners—cheap to lease or buy.
- Can capture voter intent better, improve accuracy. (cf Merced, San Luis Obispo, Stanislaus, Ventura).
- Puts incentives in the right place: more accurate CVRs means less hand counting in the audit.
 LEOs gain by using the most accurate and economical system.

Single Vendor, or No Vendor?

With soon-to-be-available open-source VTS (tested in 5 elections),

- Far, far cheaper than any commercial system.
- Auditable at the ballot level, unlike current commercial systems—better for election integrity.
- Not locked into contracts, maintenance, etc.; easy upgrades: "agile."
- Still can share expertise and equipment across counties, etc.

Bottlenecks

Biggest problem: getting ballot style information from the EMS, so VTS knows where to look for voters' marks.

Options:

- Some systems (e.g. DFM) make it easy to export ballot descriptions.
- Work with vendors as part of state certification of EMSs.
- Reverse engineer. (Icky.)
- Extract automatically from image, like TEVS or Clear Ballot.
- Do it by hand. (Not workable in big jurisdictions.)
- Provide free tools for ballot design. It's not that hard a problem.

Simplest incarnation

- Paper ballots designed by current EMSs.
- CCOS using COTS high speed scanners.
 \$16k scanner can image about 3,500 ballots per hour.
- Scanner prints identifier on the ballots as they are scanned.
- Open-source software interprets images.
- Open-source software lets LEOs inspect images, resolve hard cases. (Sort on mark density, undervotes, over votes, etc.; images could be deleted after this step.)
- Post results at whatever level of geography statutes require.
- "Commit" cast vote record for each ballot.
- Compliance audit to ensure audit trail is complete.
- Risk-limiting audit at the ballot level using simple tools.

Hot-Button Issue

Perceived conflict between transparency and voter anonymity.

Who is allowed to see the ballots, and under what circumstances?

- Audit requires the LEO to "commit" to the CVRs, but does not require publishing CVRs or ballot images.
- However, easiest way to commit to the CVRs is to publish them, which also allows the public to confirm that the votes add up. Improves transparency.
- If that's not politically feasible, there are alternatives that maintain most of the transparency and still let the public verify the sums. Harder to explain.

Evidence-Based Elections

- Law should require LEOs to give convincing evidence outcomes are right.
- Certifying equipment isn't enough: How was the equipment used?
- Election should generate hard evidence, checked for integrity.
- Audit trail is key. Needs to be created, curated, and scrutinized to confirm or correct the outcome.
- "I'm good at my job" is widely true, but stuff happens. Need better evidence than "trust me."
- Why regulate equipment but not curation of the audit trail?

Friendly Tools for Risk-Limiting Audits

The rules are not hard, and the tools can be simple:

http: //statistics.berkeley.edu/~stark/Vote/auditTools.htm

◆□ ▶ ◆□ ▶ ◆ □ ▶ ◆ □ ▶ ○ □ ○ ○ ○ ○

auditTools in action

		92. Diluted margin: 2.7%.	
Contest 1. Contest name: Merced Mayor fote for no more than 1 0			
tote for no more than 1 0			
Reported votes:			
Candidate 1 Name: THURSTON	Votes: 22	34	
Candidate 2 Name: GABRIAULT-ACOSTA	Votes: 12	06	
andidate 3 Name: BLAKE	Votes: 20	942	
Candidate 4 Name: SPRIGGS	Votes: 11	92	
Candidate 5 Name: RIGGLEMAN	Votes: 27	0	
Add candidate to contest 1 Remove last candidate from contest 1			
do candidate to contest 1 Remove last candidate from contest 1			
Contest 2. Contest name: Merced Councilment	iber		
ote for no more than 3 🛊			
ote for no more than 3 🛊			
Reported votes:	Votes: 18	119	
fote for no more than 3 e Reported votes: CARLISLE andidate 1 Name: CARLISLE	Votes: 18 Votes: 24		
Reported votes: Candidate 1 Name: CARLISLE Candidate 2 Name: CERVANTES		20	
Reported votes: Candidate 1 Name: CARLISLE Candidate 2 Name: CERVANTES Candidate 3 Name: CALLARDO	Votes: 24	120 13	
eported votes: andidate 1 Name: CARLUSLE (CERVANTES andidate 2 Name: CARLARDO andidate 4 Name: BOUN	Votes: 24 Votes: 94	20 13 14	
teported votes: andidate 1 Name: CARLISLE andidate 2 Name: CERVINITES andidate 3 Name: BOLIN andidate 4 Name: BOLIN andidate 5 Name LOR	Votes: 24 Votes: 94 Votes: 36	20 3 44 40	
teported votes: andidate 1 Name: [CALUSLE andidate 2 Name: [CELVANTES andidate 2 Name: [GUIN andidate 4 Name: [GUIN andidate 5 Name; [GUR andidate 5 Name; [MURHY]	Votes: 24. Votes: 94. Votes: 36. Votes: 37.	20 3 4 40 83	
teported votes: CARLISLE	Votes: 24 Votes: 94 Votes: 36 Votes: 37 Votes: 33	20 3 4 4 40 83 76	
Ieported voles: andidate 1 Name: CARUSLE CARUS	Votes: 24. Votes: 94. Votes: 36. Votes: 37. Votes: 33. Votes: 36.	20 3 4 4 40 83 76	
Ieported votes: andidate 1 Name: CALUSLE andidate 2 Name: CERVANTS andidate 2 Name: CALUREO andidate 4 Name: SOLIN andidate 6 Name. LOR andidate 6 Name. DOSSETTI	Votes: 24. Votes: 94. Votes: 36. Votes: 37. Votes: 33. Votes: 36.	20 3 4 4 40 83 76	
eported votes: andidate 1 Name: CARUSLE andidate 9 Name: CERUAYTS andidate 9 Name: CERUAYTS andidate 9 Name: BOLN andidate 6 Name: IOR andidate 6 Name: MURPHY andidate 8 Name: POLLARD tetratete 1s userus2); Mense las under tere userus2)	Votes: 24. Votes: 94. Votes: 36. Votes: 37. Votes: 33. Votes: 36.	20 3 4 4 40 83 76	
eported votes: andidate 1 Name: CARUSE andidate 2 Name: CERVAYTS andidate 2 Name: CERVAYTS andidate 4 Name: BOLN andidate 6 Name: IR andidate 6 Name: IR andidate 6 Name: IR andidate 6 Name: IR MURPY MURPY Multiple (TeLNBO Multiple (Te	Votes: 24. Votes: 94. Votes: 36. Votes: 37. Votes: 33. Votes: 36.	20 3 4 4 40 83 76	
eported voles: andidate 1 Name: CARUSE andidate 0 Name: CENVAYTS andidate 0 Name: CENVAYTS andidate 0 Name: IGUN andidate 0 Name: IGUN andidate 0 Name: IGN andidate 0 Na	Votes: 24. Votes: 94. Votes: 36. Votes: 37. Votes: 33. Votes: 36.	20 3 4 4 40 83 76	
eported votes: andidate 1 Name: CARLISLE andidate 9 Name: CERVANTS andidate 9 Name: CERVANTS andidate 9 Name: ICRN andidate 9 Name: ICRN andidate 6 Name: ICRN andidate 8 Name: ICRN andidate 8 Name: ICRN andidate 9 Name:	Votes: 24 Votes: 94 Votes: 36 Votes: 37 Votes: 33 Votes: 33 Votes: 33 Votes: 10	20 3 4 40 83 76 18	
eported votes: andidate 1 Name: (CARUSLE andidate 0 Name: (CALUBDO andidate 0 Name: (CALUBDO andidate 0 Name: (CALUBDO andidate 0 Name: (CAR andidate 0 Name: (CAR andidate 0 Name: (CARUADO andidate 0 Na	Votes: 24. Votes: 36 Votes: 37 Votes: 37 Votes: 33 Votes: 33 Votes: 10 Votes: 10	20 3 4 40 83 76 18 Expected rate of 2-vote overstatements (a decimal number): 0.001	

Random sampling

Pseudo-Random Sample of Ballots
Seed: 12082217
Number of ballots: 7120
Current sample number: 198
Draw this many ballots: 198 draw sample reset
Ballots selected: d show sequence numbers o show hash values
Incurrent, number, hallot 12,5463 2,5463 5,2453 5,
Ballots selected, sorted:
$\begin{array}{c} 18.8249.91197,22224,124,254,569,189,416,422,447,501,177,837,178,760,811,922,940,964,964,964,1006,1\\ 07,1007,1007,1107,1007,1007,1001,241,1282,1296,1241,1014,441,444,144,164,149,1103,1146,156,101,1467,174,174,176,191,101,164,156,101,1467,174,174,176,191,101,1647,1644,101,191,191,164,191,101,191,191,191,191,191,191,191,191$
Ballots selected, sorted, duplicates removed:
$\begin{array}{c} 38.2, 9.09, 107, 22, 24.12, 456, 569, 389, 416, 422, 447, 501, 177, 847, 870, 831, 922, 940, 946, 966, 100c, 1\\ 077, 1067, 1107, 1067, 1107, 1061, 242, 1482, 1980, 1401, 446, 144, 417, 446, 146, 101, 1601, 1645, 1561, 1561, 121, 1677, 1577, 1576, 1877, 1877, 1879, 1897, 1877, 1879, 1897, 1877, 1879, 1897, 1877, 1879, 1897, 1877, 1879, 1897, 1877, 1879, 1897, 1877, 1879, 1897, 1877, 1879, 1897, 1877, 1879, 1897, 1877, 1879, 1897, 1877, 1879, 1877, 1879, 1877, 1879, 1877, 1879, 1877, 1879, 1877, 1879, 1877, 1879, 1877, 1879, 1877, 1879$
Repeated ballots:
Ballot, multiplicity 6032,2

Finding ballots using a ballot manifest

Ballot manifest	: (batch label, ballots) pairs separated by commas, one pair per line
Merced1-cvr.tx	
Merced11-cvr.t	xt.284
Merced13&15-	cvr.txt.423
Merced14-cvr.t	xt.163
Merced16-cvr.t	xt.257
Merced17-cvr.t	
Merced18-cvr.t	xt.237
Merced2-cvr.tx	
Merced20&21-	
Merced22&29-	
Merced23&26-	
Merced24&25-	
Merced27&32-	
Merced28-cvr.1	
Merced3&30-c	
Merced31&33	
Merced4&12-c	
Merced5&9&10	
Merced6&19-c	
Merced7&8-cyr	131,369
Ballots to look	up (separated by commas);
35,82,98,99,19	7,220,241,254,256,369,389,416,422,447,501,573,638,738,760,831,932,9
35,82,98,99,19	17,220,241,254,256,369,389,416,422,447,501,573,638,738,760,831,932,9 5,1027,1067,1197,1208,1234,1285,1298,1410,1446,1464,1476,1495,150
35,82,98,99,19 0,964,986,100 1548,1568,162	7,220,241,254,256,369,389,416,422,447,501,573,638,738,760,831,932,9 5,1027,1067,1197,1208,1234,1285,1298,1410,1446,1464,1476,1495,150 1,1647,1745,1778,1877,1897,1899,1947,1973,2023,2061,2133,2173,220
35,82,98,99,19 0,964,986,100 1548,1568,162 2241,2318,233	7,220,241,254,256,369,389,416,422,447,501,573,638,738,760,831,932,9 5,1027,1067,1197,1208,1234,1285,1298,1410,1446,1464,1476,1495,150 11,1647,1745,1778,1877,1879,1899,1947,1973,2023,2061,2133,2173,220 9,2398,2400,2407,2514,2557,2654,2660,2666,2725,2744,2760,2847,286
35,82,98,99,19 0,964,986,100 1548,1568,162 2241,2318,233 2894,3119,312	7,220,241,254,256,369,389,416,422,447,501,573,638,738,760,81,932,9 5,1027,1067,1197,1208,1234,1285,1298,1410,1446,1464,1476,1495,150 1,1047,1745,1778,1877,1897,1899,1947,1973,2023,2061,2133,2173,2207 9,2398,2400,2407,2514,2557,2654,2660,2666,2725,2744,2760,2847,266 3,1397,3223,327,3323,233,2399,3366,3370,340,3444,3459,3385,356
35,82,98,99,19 0,964,986,100 1548,1568,162 2241,2318,233 2894,3119,312 3598,3624,362 4261,4286,432	7,20,241,244,256,363,389,416,422,447,501,773,618,718,708,708,31,927, 10,721,057,11057,11208,1324,1255,1398,140,1445,1464,1476,1495,150 1,1647,1745,1778,1877,1879,1899,1947,1973,2023,2061,2133,2173,220 2,1382,400,407,2154,257,245,4602,666,2752,272,474,270,2147,280 2,1382,400,407,2154,257,245,3400,2469,275,272,2442,700,2487,248 3,1457,2718,3778,3778,3778,3102,3393,3467,3396,31977,4184,177,423,425 3,1457,3718,3778,3778,3178,3102,3453,347,3396,31977,4184,177,423,425 3,1457,3718,3778,3778,3178,3102,3453,347,3396,31977,4184,177,423,425 3,1457,3718,3778,3778,3778,3102,3453,347,3396,31977,4184,177,423,425 3,1457,3718,3778,3778,3778,3178,3102,3453,347,3396,31977,4184,177,423,425 3,1457,3718,3778,3778,3778,3178,3178,3178,3106,31977,4184,177,423,425 3,1457,3718,3778,3778,3778,3178,3102,3453,347,3396,31977,4184,177,423,425 3,1457,3718,3778,3778,3778,3178,3102,3453,347,3396,31977,4184,177,423,425 3,1457,3718,3778,3778,3178,3178,3178,3178,317
35,82,98,99,19 0,964,986,100 1548,1568,162 2241,2318,233 2894,3119,312 3598,3624,362 4261,4286,432 4712,4715,474	7, 20, 24, 24, 25, 363, 384, 16, 422, 447, 50, 157, 518, 718, 708, 703, 913, 927, 9 50, 27, 1607, 1107, 1208, 124, 125, 129, 1401, 1464, 1464, 1467, 1465, 1505, 1502, 1167, 1127, 1278, 1279,
35,82,98,99,19 0,964,986,100 1548,1568,162 2241,2318,233 2894,3119,312 3598,3624,362 4261,4286,432 4712,4715,474 5073,5116,511	7,20,24,154,256,369,382,416,422,447,501,772,381,738,760,331,932, 50,721,057,1057,1057,1057,080,1234,1252,1290,140,1464,1464,1074,1495,130 11,647,1745,1778,1877,1879,1899,1947,1973,2032,3061,2133,2173,220 2038,240,240,276,213,252,524,545,0566,2372,5274,247,062,847,288 2038,240,2472,712,123,1232,1232,1299,1366,3170,1456,3444,345,3185,135 31,107,212,327,1423,1247,1420,2483,2437,1506,3170,1456,3444,345,3185,135 31,107,327,315,3747,1460,2483,3187,1506,3170,1457,1422,144 48,7424,7754,7754,477,4802,483,1347,1457,144,247,448,4894,4922,4976,447,445,214,447,447,448,4894,4922,4976,447,447,447,447,447,447,447,447,447,4
35,82,98,99,19 0,964,986,100 1548,1568,162 2241,2318,233 2894,3119,312 3598,3624,362 4261,4286,432 4712,4715,474 5073,5116,511	7,20,24,154,256,369,382,416,422,447,501,772,381,738,760,331,932, 50,721,057,1057,1057,1057,080,1234,1252,1290,140,1464,1464,1074,1495,130 11,647,1745,1778,1877,1879,1899,1947,1973,2032,3061,2133,2173,220 2038,240,240,276,213,252,524,545,0566,2372,5274,247,062,847,288 2038,240,2472,712,123,1232,1232,1299,1366,3170,1456,3444,345,3185,135 31,107,212,327,1423,1247,1420,2483,2437,1506,3170,1456,3444,345,3185,135 31,107,327,315,3747,1460,2483,3187,1506,3170,1457,1422,144 48,7424,7754,7754,477,4802,483,1347,1457,144,247,448,4894,4922,4976,447,445,214,447,447,448,4894,4922,4976,447,447,447,447,447,447,447,447,447,4
35,82,98,99,19 0,964,986,100 1548,1568,162 2241,2318,233 2894,3119,312 3598,3624,362 4261,4286,432 4712,4715,474 5073,5116,511	7,20,24,154,256,369,382,416,422,447,501,772,381,738,760,331,932, 50,721,057,1057,1057,1057,080,1234,1252,1290,140,1464,1464,1074,1495,130 11,647,1745,1778,1877,1879,1899,1947,1973,2032,3061,2133,2173,220 2038,240,240,276,213,252,524,545,0566,2372,5274,247,062,847,288 2038,240,2472,712,123,1232,1232,1299,1366,3170,1456,3444,345,3185,135 31,107,212,327,1423,1247,1420,2483,2437,1506,3170,1456,3444,345,3185,135 31,107,327,315,3747,1460,2483,3187,1506,3170,1457,1422,144 48,7424,7754,7754,477,4802,483,1347,1457,144,247,448,4894,4922,4976,447,445,214,447,447,448,4894,4922,4976,447,447,447,447,447,447,447,447,447,4
35,82,98,99,19 0,964,986,100 1548,1568,162 2241,2318,233 2894,3119,312 3598,3624,362 4261,4286,432 4712,4715,474 5073,5116,511 5658,5681,569 Took up ballots	$\begin{array}{c} 7,20,24,15,45,25,80,389,416,422,447,501,778,261,778,760,31,9123,\\ 5,72,106,71,107,1107,100,1124,125,120,100,144,164,140,176,1405,150,100,146,146,140,150,150,146,146,140,146,146,146,146,146,146,146,146,146,146$
35,82,98,99,19 0,964,986,100 1548,1568,162 2241,2318,233 2894,3119,312 3598,3624,362 4261,4286,432 4712,4715,474 5073,5116,511 5658,5681,569 Nork up ballots. Sorted look up	7, 20, 24, 154, 156, 369, 384, 164, 422, 447, 201, 177, 318, 718, 700, 317, 302, 710, 710, 710, 710, 710, 710, 710, 710
35,82,98,99,19 0,964,986,100 1548,1568,162 2241,2318,233 2894,3119,312 3398,3624,362 4261,4286,432 4712,4715,474 5073,5116,511 5658,5681,569 Took up baltots Sorted lookup sorted_number	7, 20, 24, 25, 42, 56, 36, 38, 44, 62, 24, 47, 50, 175, 26, 17, 28, 70, 63, 19, 28, 17, 20, 24, 25, 15, 25, 16, 25, 24, 25, 12, 26, 10, 14, 46, 14, 64, 167, 149, 51, 100, 11, 146, 14, 154, 176, 149, 51, 100, 14, 146, 146, 147, 149, 150, 150, 150, 140, 140, 140, 140, 140, 140, 140, 14
35,82,98,99,19 0,964,986,100 1548,1568,162 2241,2318,233 2894,3119,312 3598,3624,362 4261,4286,432 4712,4715,474 5073,5116,511 5658,5681,569 Test up battos Sorted lookup sorted_number sorted_number	7, 20, 24, 254, 256, 369, 384, 46, 422, 447, 501, 778, 261, 778, 770, 371, 302, 7 17, 20, 24, 254, 256, 369, 384, 416, 422, 447, 501, 778, 261, 778, 770, 319, 302, 102, 103, 104, 107, 1073, 1073, 1074, 1075, 1070, 1074, 1075, 1070, 1074, 1075, 1070, 1074, 1075, 1070, 1074, 1074, 1075, 1070, 1074, 1074, 1075, 1070, 1074, 1074, 1075, 1070, 1074, 1074, 1075, 1070, 1074, 1074, 1075, 1070, 1074, 1074, 1075, 1070, 1074, 1074, 1075, 1070, 1074, 1074, 1075, 1076, 1074, 1074, 1075, 1076, 1074, 1
35,82,98,99,19 0,964,986,100 1548,1568,162 2241,2318,233 2894,3119,312 3598,3624,362 4261,426,432 4261,426,432 4712,4715,474 5073,5116,511 5658,5681,569 1664,up baltost Sorted lookup sorted_number 1, 35, Merced1	7, 20, 24, 1254, 126, 805, 886, 146, 22, 447, 501, 775, 208, 778, 778, 706, 311, 923, 17, 200, 241, 507, 1067, 107, 1080, 1134, 1263, 1296, 1141, 1073, 2003, 1081, 2113, 21173, 2003, 1014, 1
35,82,98,99,19 0,964,986,100 1548,1568,162 2241,2318,233 2894,3119,312 3598,3624,362 4261,4266,432 4712,4715,474 5073,5116,511 5658,5681,569 50746,100kup 50746,100kup 507ted,100kup 1,35, Merced1 2,82, Merced1 2, 82, Merced1	7,202,41,254,256,369,384,014,422,447,201,77,261,774,706,31,923, 17,202,412,542,556,369,384,014,422,447,201,775,261,738,706,31,923, 11,647,1745,1776,1677,1879,1899,1947,1972,2023,2061,2133,2173,202 13,982,400,447,215,115,157,545,456,066,2723,1474,470,1487,150 39,817,3174,8174,8177,1897,1897,1897,1897,1964,1717,283,245 39,817,3174,183,778,3174,3820,3893,387,3065,3977,1164,177,423,245 39,817,3174,3174,3174,3174,3820,3893,387,3065,3977,1164,177,423,245 39,817,3175,4774,4002,4005,4812,481,4817,4828,4893,4922,4957,484 4,4794,4755,4779,4402,4405,4434,444,417,482,4454,4457,4452,4574,164 6,4794,4752,4752,4754,474,474,474,444,444,417,482,4374,4252,4374,64 6,4794,4752,4757,4704,402,4254,5303,1534,5414,542,426,4252,4374,64 1,5176,5174,5174,5174,5174,5174,5174,514,5174,514,5174,517
35,82,98,99,19 0,964,986,100 1548,1568,162 2241,2318,233 2894,3119,312 3598,3624,362 4261,4286,432 4712,4715,474 5073,5116,511 5658,5681,569 Norkup ballots	7, 20, 24, 254, 256, 369, 384, 416, 422, 447, 201, 772, 304, 718, 700, 317, 320, 716, 718, 710, 716, 716, 716, 716, 716, 716, 716, 716
35,82,98,99,19 0,964,986,100 1548,1568,162 2241,2318,233 2894,3119,312 3598,3624,362 4261,4286,432 4712,4715,474 5073,5116,511 5658,5681,569 507ted lookup sorted, number 1, 35, Merced1 1, 35, Merced1 3, 98, Merced1	7, 20, 24, 125, 126, 126, 369, 389, 416, 422, 447, 501, 772, 301, 718, 700, 317, 320, 701, 719, 710, 719, 710, 719, 710, 719, 710, 719, 710, 719, 710, 719, 710, 719, 710, 719, 710, 719, 710, 719, 710, 719, 710, 710, 710, 710, 710, 710, 710, 710
35,82,98,99,19 0,964,986,100 1548,1568,162 2241,2318,233 3598,3624,362 4712,4715,474 5073,5116,511 5658,5681,565 foot up ballots Sorted Nookup sorted, number 1, 35, Merced1 2, 82, Merced1 3, 98, Merced1 4, 99, Merced1	7, 20, 24, 1254, 256, 366, 384, 46, 422, 447, 201, 177, 318, 718, 706, 317, 302, 7 17, 20, 241, 254, 256, 366, 384, 416, 422, 447, 201, 177, 318, 718, 706, 317, 302, 101, 146, 145, 150, 150, 121, 145, 145, 145, 145, 145, 145, 145, 14

- 8, 254, Merced11-cvr.txt, 92 9, 256. Merced11-cvr.txt, 94

Should more ballots be audited?



The Future

The overall election and canvass process should correct its own errors before announcing results, or report that it can't guarantee it corrected its errors (for instance, because the audit trail can't be shown to be intact).

Resilient Canvass Framework

Known minimum chance that the overall system (human, hardware, software, procedures) gives the correct election outcome—when it gives an outcome.

- Use voting system that creates a voter-verified audit trail.
- Conduct a compliance audit to ensure that the audit trail is accurate and complete.
- If so, conduct a risk-limiting audit. If not, do not declare an outcome.